Panel Members

Han Brezet (Chair) Technical University Delft, The Netherlands
Arthur Eger BlauwZand Publishing, The Netherlands
Daan van Eijk Technical University Delft, The Netherlands
De Ruyck Stefaan Royal Academy of Fine Arts Antwerp, Belgium

Lily Diaz-Kommonen Aalto University, Finland

Marion McEnroy Galway-Mayo Institute of Technology, Ireland

Ruaidhri Neavyn Higher Education Authority / Department of Education and Skills Ireland, Ireland

Wim De Temmerman University College Ghent, Belgium

R&D Units

Centro de Estudos de Sociologia e Estética Musical (CESEM)	Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas (FCSH/UNL)
Centro de Estudos de Teatro (CET)	Faculdade de Letras da Universidade de Lisboa (FL/ULisboa)
Centro de História da Arte e Investigação Artística (CHAIA)	Universidade de Évora (UE)
Centro de Investigação e de Estudos em Belas-Artes (CIEBA)	Faculdade de Belas-Artes da Universidade de Lisboa (FBA/ULisboa)
Centro de Investigação em Artes e Comunicação (CIAC)	Universidade do Algarve (UAlg)
Centro de Investigação em Ciência e Tecnologia das Artes (CITAR)	Universidade Católica Portuguesa (UCP)
esad idea, investigação em design e arte (esadidea)	Associação para a Promoção da Investigação em Design e Arte (ESAD IDEA)
Instituto de Etnomusicologia - Centro de Estudos em Música e Dança (INET-md)	Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas (FCSH/UNL)
Instituto de História da Arte (IHA/FCSH/NOVA)	Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas (FCSH/UNL)
Instituto de Investigação em Arte, Design e Sociedade (i2ADS)	Faculdade de Belas-Artes da Universidade do Porto (FBA/UP)
Instituto de Investigação em Design, Media e Cultura (ID+)	Universidade de Aveiro (UA)
Laboratório de Investigação em Design e Artes (LIDA)	Instituto Politécnico de Leiria (IPLeiria)
Unidade de Investigação em Design e Comunicação (UNIDCOM/IADE)	Associação para a Investigação em Design, Marketing e Comunicação (EUROPEIA ID)
Vidro e Cerâmica para as Artes (VICARTE)	NOVA.ID.FCT - Associação para a Inovação e Desenvolvimento da FCT (NOVA.ID.FCT/FCTUNL/UNL)

R&D Unit: Centro de Estudos de Sociologia e Estética Musical (CESEM)

Coordinator: Manuel Pedro Ramalho Ferreira

Integrated PhD Researchers: 87

Overall Quality Grade: EXCELLENT Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 5
(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5
(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 1256 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 5

Programmatic Funding: 352 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the musicology research activities produced by this group to be Excellent. Manuel Pedro Ramalho Ferreira indicated their unique offering as a reference hub of substantial numbers of researchers, inaugurating new trends in Digital Musicology, with online databases and archives making a significant contribution to Portuguese patrimony and contributing thus to International expertise in Portuguese heritage. Excellent National affiliations with researchers also associated with Polytechnic Institutes of Lisbon (ESML) and Porto (ESMAE), and the Univ. of Évora. Having competed convincingly they will organise and host the 'MedRen' Conference the most important International scientific event in the discipline in 2021.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be excellent. The research groups are diverse and interdisciplinary including: Early Music Studies; Music in the Modern Period; Contemporary Music; Critical Theory and Communication; Education and Human Development. Noteworthy examples of National activity include the annual CESEM Symposium and ENIM event. Noteworthy examples of internationally acclaimed achievement include an excellent suite of international publications in peer-reviewed, prestigious platforms, including Journal of American Musicology Group, Acta Musicologica, Opera Quarterly, New German Critique, Psychology of Music among others. Their approach to community outreach could certainly be considered as areas of national reference in terms of sharing the ideal of human development and the promotion of social well-being mediated by music, using scientific methods.

The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be very good. The group has clear thematic areas of activity which underpin their organisation and their established PhD programmes. There is concern as to whether a sufficient number of people are involved in the development and implementation of the overall strategy of the Unit. Staff meetings do not occur on a fixed basis, which for a R&D Unit of this scale is necessary.

With regards the evaluation criterion of Ethics, we advise more formalisation of CESEM's protocols in preparing researchers for working with children and vulnerable adults, showing evidence in their programmes of linkage and compliance with European Union guidelines beyond general police vetting and documents of consent from participants. Where working with children is concerned, it is absolutely necessary to develop a code of conduct in order to create an elaborated context for all the people involved.

Although there are a number of initiatives towards more formal quality control procedures, a large part of these processes appear to be insufficiently formalized. The institute should make efforts to improve this.

R&D Unit: Centro de Estudos de Teatro (CET)

Coordinator: Maria João Oliveira Carvalho de Almeida

Integrated PhD Researchers: 30

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 366 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The CET application is impressive with a clear outline of academic achievements of integrated PhD researcher's work of National importance to the Theatre in Portugal in the context of European traditions.

They have produced two books with major international publishers (Peter Lang and John Benjamins); two articles with international peer-review journals; five articles with major national publishers, and a series of high-quality monographs and edited publications regarding the cultural history of the theatre in Portugal. These include: a history of the theatre from the 1850s to the early 20th century; the biography of an important entrepreneur and dramaturge, the initial compilation of leading literary figure and flaneur, Fernando Pessoa.

Very good evidence of free-access online digital resources and opportunity for interdisciplinarity which has helped in: 'achieving internationalisation and attracting researchers and PhD students, with MA and PhD theses on theatre history and theory having increased significantly'. An important new development – the 'computer technology and humanities' is a good contemporary approach.

The CET has already highlighted 5 important contributions that meet several of FCT evaluation criteria for Very Good work. Another project presented includes work on Migrant Theatre which focuses on work with immigrant communities in Lisbon.

Regarding internationalisation, the CET journal 'Sinais de Cena' established in 2016 became a peer-review platform for dissemination of research and 'stimulated the interest of the main theatre companies, cultural associations and official entities in working with CET researchers on initiatives based on CET's proven expertise: tailor-made theatre courses, archive organisation, dramaturgy workshops and publications.'

Highlights in researcher participation in international networks were the International Federation for Theatre Research; the European Association for the Study of Theatre and Performance (ExCom); Hispanic Digital Humanities; Project TEEN – Theatre European Engagement Network; Centre for Global Theatre History (LM University, Munich).

A strong team and a thriving network are some of the strongholds of CET. Some PhD researchers contribute through facilitating Theatre Studies seminars, to advanced training and critical mass creation in the field and also digital base research training (Opsis, HTPonline and CETbase). The Centre is receiving international recognition, through their engagement in European research projects, through their membership as key partners in important organizations related to topics in digital humanities, as well as theatre research. Lack of resources however, make their full participation in international activities impossible.

The work is organized along three clusters alongside the theme of cultural history of the theatre: (1) Critical Discourses; (2) History of the Theatre; (3) Theatre and Image. These three clusters are very different in how they organize themselves

to carry on their administrative duties. What is very good and remains constant however, is the transdisciplinary perspective which they have developed and enables different perspectives from the sources under study to emerge.

Given the growth in numbers of researchers that the R&D Unit has attracted, the funding request does not seem inflated. It's essential moving into 2020 for updated IT services for the Centre to function, progress and be competitive. Costs of making translations from Portuguese into English is well justified regarding the need for international profile.

The Centre would need a better space, with more modern facilities for its workers to meet as well as carry on their research activities. A more formal organization of internal processes and procedures is recommended. More management resources and a key and stable base in the area of information technology are of critical importance to stabilize the work being done and to create a solid foundation that will enable the Center to achieve the world recognition it deserves.

R&D Unit: Centro de História da Arte e Investigação Artística (CHAIA)

Coordinator: Paulo Alexandre Rodrigues Simões Rodrigues

Integrated PhD Researchers: 50

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD

Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers:

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 638 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Very Good. The level of quality and relevance observed is supported by a range of projects across three clear thematic lines. Specific research projects of note include "City and Spectacle", a vision of pre-earthquake Lisbon and Evora 3D recreating the History of Évora.

The approach taken to the internationalisation of their activities is strong with researchers engaging in the development of international collaborations and networks of relevance to the main thematic lines of the group. Examples of note include the project "+Sul" developed in partnership with the Aga Khan Foundation.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Very Good. The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines spanning archaeology, architecture, art history, landscape, theatre and design, which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy. Their use of "research by design" as a pedagogical approach in architecture was also noteworthy. Their social, cultural and economic impact on the Évora region should not be underestimated and their commitment to supporting the development of the region through their research work is commendable.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Very Good. The group has clear thematic areas of activity which underpin their organisation and their established PhD programmes. The close proximity and collaboration with the Hercules research facility is and will continue to be a valuable relationship in the development of the R&D Unit can co-operate with.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group are encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

The group should also consider how it can increase levels of funding from other sources including philanthropy and commercial activities.

Consideration should be given to expanding the use of "research by design" into other disciplines for e.g. product design.

The number of PhD fellowships, if applied for, was awarded based on the overall grade obtained e.g. a score of 4 equates to 4 PhD fellowships, a score of 5 equates to 5 PhD fellowships. The overall Programmatic Funding was awarded on the basis of the overall grade obtained, including the support to hire 1 Junior PhD Researcher contract to the Unit.

Evaluation Panel: ARTS AND HUMANITIES – Arts and Design, Artistic and Musical Development

R&D Unit: Centro de Investigação e de Estudos em Belas-Artes (CIEBA)

Coordinator: João Paulo Gomes de Araújo Queiroz

Integrated PhD Researchers: 94

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD

Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 4

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 3

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 1233 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Very Good. The level of quality and relevance observed is supported by their success in securing funding over many years.

The approach taken to the internationalisation of their activities is strong with researchers engaging in the development of international collaborations and networks of relevance to the main thematic lines of the group. The concluded PhD theses up to 2017 were in a diverse range of practices. Examples of achievements by Integrated Researchers include the NOVO BANCO PHOTO 2015 prize, and international prizes and special commendations for the feature film "LUZ OBSCURA" 2017; and an Acquisition Prize for "Coleção Navacerrada" at Drawing Room Art Fair, Madrid, Círculo de Bellas Artes, Spain in 2017.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Very Good. The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. Their publications were very good, peer-reviewed and indicative of a very good level of philosophical inquiry and theoretical discourse. The CIEBA has established a strong record of artistic monographs and in-house publications, some peer-reviewed.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Good. The group has thematic areas of activity which underpin their organisation and their established PhD programmes. However, the level of interdisciplinarity and collaboration observed across the different disciplines of the research group could be enhanced. The operation of the management structure in terms of sharing the burden of responsibility across disciplines should also be examined.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one or more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group is encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach needs to evolve.

The lack of an exhibition strategy for completed PhD work is a missed opportunity to showcase and assist graduates in enhancing their profiles and an exhibition strategy could be considered in the future.

The number of PhD fellowships, if applied for, was awarded based on the overall grade obtained e.g. a score of 4 equates to 4 PhD fellowships, a score of 5 equates to 5 PhD fellowships. The overall Programmatic Funding was awarded on the basis of the overall grade obtained, including the support to hire 1 Junior PhD Researcher contract to the Unit.

Evaluation Panel: ARTS AND HUMANITIES – Arts and Design, Artistic and Musical Development

R&D Unit: Centro de Investigação em Artes e Comunicação (CIAC)

Coordinator: Mirian Estela Nogueira Tavares

Integrated PhD Researchers: 40

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD

Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

- (B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers:
- (C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 585 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Very Good. The level of quality and relevance observed is supported by their success in securing substantial European and other non FCT funding sources to support their endeavours. Their approach to online delivery of their research programmes and the use of their activities as a platform for community outreach could certainly be considered as areas of national reference in terms of pedagogical development. Specific research projects of note include the Telemediad-Arte funded by the Calouste Gulbenkian foundation and M5SAR Mobile five senses augmented reality system for museums funded by the Portugal 2020 programme.

The approach taken to the internationalisation of their activities is very strong with all researchers engaging in the development of international collaborations and networks of relevance to the main thematic lines of the group. Examples of note include the ChIMERA programme funded by the Interreg MED programme and framework for film education Europe.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Very Good. The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy. Their social, cultural and economic impact on the region should not be underestimated, and their commitment to the development of the region through their research activities is commendable.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Very Good. The group has clear thematic areas of activity which underpin their organisation and their established PhD programmes. Their approach to the development of a national centre of expertise for arts and communication by actively integrating relevant researchers from other universities, but also from the countries polytechnics is noteworthy. Their approach in this regard, could be considered as an area of national reference for the development of national centres of excellence which draw on and combine expertise from all sectors of the higher education system in the interest of maximising the benefit and impact of R&D activities.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group are encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

The approach taken to the integration of polytechnics within their research group could also be expanded into the international arena thus providing the opportunity to create a unique international network in arts and communication focussed on maximising the impact of their R&D activities internationally.

The number of PhD fellowships, if applied for, was awarded based on the overall grade obtained e.g. a score of 4 equates to 4 PhD fellowships, a score of 5 equates to 5 PhD fellowships. The overall Programmatic Funding was awarded on the basis of the overall grade obtained, including the support to hire 1 Junior PhD Researcher contract to the Unit.

Evaluation Panel: ARTS AND HUMANITIES – Arts and Design, Artistic and Musical Development

R&D Unit: Centro de Investigação em Ciência e Tecnologia das Artes (CITAR)

Coordinator: Cristina Fernandes Alves de Sá

Integrated PhD Researchers: 46

Overall Quality Grade: EXCELLENT Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 5

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 5

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 764 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

PhD Fellowships: 5

Programmatic Funding: 352 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by CITAR to be Excellent. They have evolved into 4 focus-based areas of research: Sound and Music; New Media Art; Cinema and Cinematic Art; Heritage and Conservation-Restoration. In 2016 the Centre won the prestigious EU Prize for Cultural Heritage/Europa Nostra Award for the conservation and restoration project of the Cathedral of Santarém.

The approach taken to the internationalisation of their activities is Excellent, aligning itself as an R&D Unit alongside members of excellent international calibre. CITAR edited a thematic dossier for the Portuguese Journal of Musicology with contributions from scholars from UChicago, UCincinnatti, URochester, ULondon, UCalifornia and CITAR; and organized the first Porto International Conference on Music Gesture as Creative Interface (2016) attracting diverse communications from 22 countries in Europe, North and South America, India and Japan. CITAR collaborated with the Museum of Art, Architecture and Technology (MAAT) from 2016-18 developing technological infrastructure and artistic problem-solving skills for several high-profile exhibitions including 'Untitled #1: Orchestral' collaborating with sound sculptors. In 2016 they organised the First International Conference on Public Art in the Era of Digital Creativity, registering participation from over 40 contributors from Portugal, Spain, Italy, Germany, Latvia and Brazil. Additionally, CITAR's contribution to the Annual Meeting of AIM, the Research Association for the Moving Image attracted over 200 scholars from Europe and the Americas fostering a strong, effective bond with the Screenwriters Research Network resulting in a successful bid for hosting the 13th Annual Conference of SRN in 2020, resulting in the e-book: 'Cartography of the Borders in the Audiovisual Narrative'.

The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy. Excellent selection of publications from 2013-17 shown, which appeared in prestigious peer-reviewed academic journals, including long established publications such as the Leonardo, Journal of Music Theory and Journal of the Audio Engineering Society, from the USA; contemporary web platforms Modernmuix; international book chapters published in Ghent, Berlin, and CITAR's own Journal of Science and Technology of the Arts provides excellent open access and dissemination of CITAR's research.

Their flagship Journal of Science and Technology of the Arts CITARJ is a peer reviewed annual publication (Scopus and WOS-ESCI indexed) and promotes artworks, knowledge and research in the Arts. The project "Multi-Layered Space in Music" 2015-2020 contributes to the provision of music-analytical methodologies for a highly valued international repertoire (Bartók, Stravinsky, Milhaud). Excellent translations into English are made available with support provided to their PhD students with translating. CITAR was found to be excellent in respecting the principles and practices of Open Science.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Excellent. The Integrated Researchers are extremely committed and hard-working as acknowledged by their PhD students who commended their supervisors as a major reason for choosing to pursue their studies at CITAR. Seed projects are core to their advanced training and funding policy

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group is encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

Consideration should also be given to how they can further enhance and measure the social, cultural and economic impact of their activities.

R&D Unit: esad idea, investigação em design e arte (esadidea)

Coordinator: José Manuel da Silva Bartolo

Integrated PhD Researchers: 20

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

- (B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 4
- (C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 257 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by ESAD IDEA to be Very Good. Clear aims and aspirations articulated with many goals are already achieved. They set a swift high bar for itself as an academic institution, as evidenced by hundreds of conferences, workshops, publications and research projects. The quantity is good, as are the publications, in that they are well designed and have very good content for teaching purposes, and for the preservation and promotion of Portuguese design. They are not concerned simply with art history but rather adopting a cultural historical approach and further developing design history. Their activities are realized with top-notch institutions such as Milan Triennale, the upcoming Porto Biennale, in which they have played a key role as organizers, and the House of Design. They have used the ERASMUS program to instantiate many international collaborations, including research projects such as their Design Thinking project, applied to Education and Training, that included six other European nations. Most recently they have also begun to get involved with using more advanced technology (virtual and augmented reality).

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Very Good. The Unit has a highly motivated, professional and creative staff. They have already managed to attract a good level of national research funding. The growth in the number of Integrated Researchers with PhDs is very good, steadily rising to 20. Between the years of 2014-2017 they have graduated at various universities, with six PhDs. The dissertations examined are of high quality in terms of contents as well as in the design and realization of the book. An inspiring physical workplace.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation was found to be Very Good. The structure of the programmatic range has a clear design thinking foundation and is comprehensive – with 4 major fields – research for, through and into design, and contextual research. This quadrant model is repeated in the 4 areas of research – which are very market driven and industry related – product design innovation; architecture and design; design studies; multi-scaler design. The organisational model is clear, with a scientific committee and a director's board.

The range and scope of publications will need to be developed over the coming years. The in-house publication does not mention peer-review, and this might be considered to make the online publications more rigorous and competitive. The programmatic range could benefit from more emphasis on societal themes relating to eco-design. The Panel suggests that sustainable design be more visibly incorporated to answer the needs of the planet in these urgent times of climate change. It is essential that ESAD IDEA should be able to offer its own PhD program.

The overall Programmatic Funding was awarded on the basis of the overall grade obtained, including the support to hire 1 Junior PhD Researcher contract to the Unit.

R&D Unit: Instituto de Etnomusicologia - Centro de Estudos em Música e Dança (INET-md)

Coordinator: Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco

Integrated PhD Researchers: 104

Overall Quality Grade: EXCELLENT **Evaluation Criteria Ratings**

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 5
(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5
(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 1802 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 5

Programmatic Funding: 352 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The INET wrote a very interesting and challenging application. The Institute is a fruitful cooperation between UNL, the Politechnics of Porto and Lisboa and the University of Aveiro.

The range of areas in which research is performed is wide and diverse. The research on how music can create new identities in postcolonial and post-totalitarian communities provides original insights into how society and art can interferact. Studies on music in prisons and the professional situation of the Portuguese musicians within these contexts gave proof of the socially-engagemed practice. Studies on musical acoustics and sound led to a number of strong realisations. A spin-off from these studies is the development of a comprehensive national archive for the audio-visual heritage. The question could be raised whether this is a task for an Institute like INET or if this should not be transferred to (or funded separately, or additionally) by the government. The INET also works permanently on Portuguese National heritage in music in the Lusitania region.

The Institute has an impressive international network and is very present in refereed international publications (Routledge, Univ: of Chicago, Cambridge Univ., Oxford Univ.). It also plays an important role in the organization and participation of international conferences.

The number of PhD students and researchers shows steady growth. The Institute is highly successful in gathering national and international funding, which is positive but also necessary for an Institute of this size.

A strong team and a thriving network in a broad international context are some of the major strenghts of INET. Combined with the size of the entity and the diversity of the work done, the outcome is a highly competitive institution with an undisputable added-value.

The plans for the future are very clear and concrete. The Institute wants to work further on the lines that have been set in the past. There is a strong desire to invest more in the democratic sharing of knowledge with local communities, especially in the Lusophone world, which is partly impossible up till now for budget reasons. There is a strong ambition to find additional funding in Europe.

INET allows great autonomy to the research groups and especially to the projects, which is certainly favorable for constant bottom-up injections, but an Institute of this size has also need of a central coordination that gives direction to the many impulses that come from within and from the outer world. INET might benefit from a more formal organization of the internal decision and quality control processes.

The INET does an excellent job and should get the correct support to continue their work. The Institute should make clear what is its long-term strategy of growth and how their ambitions can be matched with the capacity of the organization to support them. Although a certain form of autonomy of the groups and projects is evident, it deserves a recommendation

to think about a more formal organization of certain processes and procedures. The infrastructure seems somewhat disappointing, e.g. the studios for the acoustic research, but there are plans – so the Panel was told during the visit – to move the Institute to another building.

A last point of concern is the workload of the collaborators. There is a direct link between scale, ambition and workload: if the ambition is too heavy to handle for the available collaborators and means, it may result in overpressure on the people.

R&D Unit: Instituto de História da Arte (IHA/FCSH/NOVA)

Coordinator: Joana Esteves da Cunha Leal

Integrated PhD Researchers: 58

Overall Quality Grade: EXCELLENT **Evaluation Criteria Ratings**

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 5
(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5
(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 5

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 812 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

PhD Fellowships: 5

Programmatic Funding: 352 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Excellent. The level of quality and relevance observed is supported by their success in publishing in high quality, peer-reviewed international publications, highly relevant to Portugal heritage and international relationships. Their approach to the development of a national centre of expertise for art history research could be considered as a national reference of excellence, which draws on and combines expertise from all sectors of the higher education system in the interest of maximising the benefit and impact of R&D activities.

The approach taken to the internationalisation of their activities is excellent, being a member of RIHA, the International Association of Research Institutes in the History of Art, aligning itself as a R&D Unit alongside members of excellent international calibre. IHA was actively involved in the organisation of 18 international conferences and as a result it is seen as a leader in the development of future thematic discourse in the art history arena. Further, IHA would be seen as an international leader in Portuguese historical relationships with other geographies including Europe, Asia, Africa and America.

The IHA has also been particularly successful in attracting research funding, of just over €1m, from a range of sources and competitive calls including EU, FCT, Gulbenkian Foundation, etc., in recent years.

The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Excellent. Publications were of excellent international, peer-reviewed standard and academic rigour, with results and data, respecting the principles and practices of Open Science. They produce two peer-reviewed journals per annum. Noteworthy publications include Alexandra Curvelo's 'Obras-primas dos Biombos Nanban; Portugal-Japão século XVII'; an excellent quality publication on topics of cross-cultural relevance for the advancement of understanding of the artefacts. Excellent scientific research has been conducted on for example supporting attribution of works in Portuguese collections to the Della Robbia workshop with scientific data. Also, excellent is the publication on the CAM Calouste Gulbenkian collection, providing a legacy of the institution for the general public and the Portuguese state.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Excellent. The Integrated Researchers are extremely committed and hard-working as acknowledged by their PhD students who commended their supervisors as a major reason for choosing to pursue their studies at IHA.

Their funding of 'Seed-projects' is noteworthy and has enabled them to develop small project ideas which can be nurtured and developed and help build the research profile in a structured way thus empowering individuals to bring innovative ideas to fruition.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group is encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

R&D Unit: Instituto de Investigação em Arte, Design e Sociedade (i2ADS)

Coordinator: Catarina Sofia Silva Martins

Integrated PhD Researchers: 26

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

- (B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 4
- (C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 3

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 360 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Very Good. The level of quality and relevance observed is supported by a range of projects across a number of research hubs. Specific research of note includes the drawing project 'Images from the Inner Body' which was awarded the University of Porto Prize for Pedagogical Innovation in 2017. They had Very Good international publications in journals such as Routledge New York and have organised several successful international conferences.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Very Good. The Integrated Researchers are drawn from a broad range of disciplines which both compliment and combine well in the development of the thematic areas of the group. The approach demonstrated by team members interviewed to the development of the group through a collegiate and interdisciplinary approach is noteworthy. An overarching theme within the faculty is a prioritisation of socially engaged practice and the development of art education with their community and stakeholders. The team were committed, enthusiastic and collegial towards each other. The team make a very good effort to demonstrate their students' creative outputs, with very good in-house publications and a dedicated exhibition space on campus highlighting very good exhibition standards.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Good. The group has clear thematic areas of activity which underpin their organisation and their established PhD programmes. It was noted that the group had undergone significant restructuring in recent years with a view to developing a clearer focus and direction.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard the group are encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

The strategic focus and organisation of the group could benefit from a re-analyse and prioritisation of their thematic areas of interest.

The group should consider how it can better capture the overall impact of their activities. Consideration could be given to the development of alternative indicators and narratives in this regard.

R&D Unit: Instituto de Investigação em Design, Media e Cultura (ID+)

Coordinator: Vasco Afonso da Silva Branco

Integrated PhD Researchers: 68

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD Evaluation Criteria Ratings

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 4

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 5

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 893 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

ID+ Center is a Very Good R&D Unit with activities that integrate the work of three universities (Aveiro, Porto and Madeira) and two Polytechnics (Porto and Madeira). The Unit overarching theme – a commitment to art and design as disciplines that yield valuable knowledge in their own right – provides participating scholars access to a rich environment in which to develop their skills and knowledge. Their work cuts across diverse sectors including: design history, culture and museography; healthcare, inclusiveness and well-being; and visual communications design. In the recent past they have engaged in a vast range of activities involving work with diverse digital media technologies, creating new pedagogies that combine multiple methods and knowledge sources, and the 'rescue' of design traditions from Portugal, among others. Some of the noteworthy projects and achievements from the period under evaluation are:

- Design innovation: Art on Chairs project, honoured at the European Commission RegioStars 2014 Awards;
- Heritage: Participation in two successful applications for UNESCO creative cities (Braga and Barcelos) as well as the Cortebel 50 'brand archaeology' and the collaborative development of footwear prototypes incorporating ancient weaving techniques and patterns;
- Healthcare: Célia Celíaca Gluten Free Lifestyle project awarded nationally with 2nd prize at the 8th edition of Poli Entrepreneurship Innovation Network.

Their approach to internationalisation is successful, producing valued outputs that include: the successful hosting of several conferences for distinguished international forum such as the International Committee on Design History and Studies (ICDHS) conference and CUMULUS international art and design institutions network in 2014; publishing in a diversity of esteemed international peer-reviewed journals such as The Design Journal (Taylor & Francis), The Poster Journal (Intellect Press) and conference proceedings such as Distributed, Ambient and Pervasive Interactions (Springer). Aside from their awards, conference activities and publications, this can be observed in their output in the academic sector where they have produced twenty-eight PhD dissertations between the years of 2013–2018.

The team is Very Good, comprising eight research groups characterised by their solid knowledge of art and design history, theory and practice and by the breadth of involvements that bring together multiple sectors including industrial design, health, heritage, media and visual communications design. A good number are working in international European programmes such as the 2014-2020 FOCUS — Frailty Management Optimization through EIP AHA Commitments and Utilisation of Stakeholders and in socially significant areas such as the Conversations About Cancer project with Portuguese Oncology Institute and INESCTEC.

The objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed are Very Good and producing results. This is a Very Good Unit with a very clear mission and understanding of its own goals. They are engaged and producing important work for academia, industry and the society in general.

ID+ should be attentive regarding the number of research groups and how the topics are dealt with across the board so as to prevent wide overlaps and confusion. In order to reach the next level of excellence, they should begin a careful study

and analysis process in order to refine their research ecosystem. Selecting from what is there now they should focus in the areas in which decide that they can really make a deep, solid contribution.

R&D Unit: Laboratório de Investigação em Design e Artes (LIDA)

Coordinator: João Pedro Faustino dos Santos

Integrated PhD Researchers: 18

Overall Quality Grade: GOOD **Evaluation Criteria Ratings**

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 3
(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 3

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 211 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

Programmatic Funding: 268 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The Panel found the quality, relevance and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Good. LIDA is a R&D Unit oriented towards the professional practices and the experimental development of knowledge in design processes and artistic practices, realising societal goals. This is mainly done in a regional context, with strong relations with local industries and government. An important area of expertise is ceramics, as a typical but threatened economic driver of the region. Considerable interest in sustainable design and circular economy is an added-value, together with the UN Sustainable Development Goals and recently funded UNESCO Chair in Arts and Cultural Management, Cities and Creativity. The Degren project, design and green engineering in the EUROACE region (Extramadura-Alentejo-Centro) is an interesting example in this field. Other areas investigate inclusion and empowering people, health and wellbeing. A significant output is their artists books, which contribute a particular form of democratic and participatory art. There is own build up knowledge in 3D printing and a fruitful collaboration with other faculties at the PolyTechnic of Leiria.

The merit of the team of Integrated Researchers was found to be Good. The 37 Integrated Researchers and specialists have good credentials and are motivated to invest in LIDA and they see this as a possibility to develop into a research-oriented organisation, as well as for their personal growth. LIDA members publish, are active in juries, conferences, competitions and curation of exhibitions.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be Very Good. The mission for the next 5 years is clear, concise and with good integration of UN Sustainable Development Goals. They have a well-structured plan of activities around 4 main objectives, from the application of new knowledge to the creation and participation of LIDA researchers in international networks. The organisation is in place to make steps in the coming years, with a scientific committee, a steering committee, a management board and an external advisory board. There is strong support from the Polytechnic of Leiria management.

There is a good potential for going forward, though the standards of research topics and publications need to improve. It is important that all members of the Unit share a vision and use capabilities in areas of animation, film and multimedia to convey the LIDA goals and visibility, both nationally and internationally.

R&D Unit: Unidade de Investigação em Design e Comunicação - UNIDCOM/IADE (UNIDCOM/IADE)

Coordinator: Maria Emília Capucho Duarte

Integrated PhD Researchers: 40

Overall Quality Grade: VERY GOOD **Evaluation Criteria Ratings**

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 4

(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 4

(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 4

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 492 K€ **Recommended Programmatic Support**

PhD Fellowships: 4

Programmatic Funding: 309 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The UNIDCOM/IADE is an established R&D Unit at IADE-Universidade Europeia accredited by the FCT in 2003 in the area of Arts and Humanities. Among the Unit primary objectives are: to cross boundaries by introducing design as an aggregating discipline; to promote design research as a transdisciplinary field of inquiry combining theory and practice; and to contribute to the solution of major social problems through design. UNIDCOM/IADE is a private institution and was recently (2019) acquired by the PERMIRA Group.

The Panel found the quality, merit and level of internationalisation of the activities produced by this group to be Very Good. Noteworthy projects include: the European Women in Architecture and Design 1918-2018 (MoMoWo) financed by the Creative Europe Programme, the Lisbon Living Lab project that makes use of the city as site for teaching design. They have also produced a large variety of high-quality expositions, traveling exhibitions, and design and scientific events including successful internationally-oriented conferences such as Senses and Sensibility (their own conference series established in 2003), CUMULUS and EDCOM. They have contributed to high visibility international peer-reviewed journals such as: Applied Ergonomics, (Elsevier); The Design Journal (Taylor &Francis); International Journal of Information Management, (Elsevier); Journal of Fashion Marketing and Management (Emerald); IJBPM (Scopus); InTech, DOI; Technology in Society (Elsevier); and the Journal of Design, Business & Society and have also established their own journal, ThRad. These efforts has enabled them to maintain a substantial quality publications output through the years. Since 2009, UNIDCOM/IADE disseminates the research outcomes also via the own IADE Press.

Gradually, UNIDCOM has changed from a more professional arts oriented school into a research oriented organization, combining design and a scientific, academic approach in a successful and colourful way. They started to recruit their own PhD students in the program since 2013 and six students have been awarded the PhD degree, with more soon to follow.

The merits of the team of integrated, talented and well-trained Postdocs drawn from a broad range of institutes and disciplines that complements the development of the thematic areas, were found to be Very Good. PhD education includes a framework of established introductory studies during the first year, followed by regular masterclasses, seminars and an annual PhD conference organized by the students. The recently designed new cluster program (Interaction Design + UX, Mapping Design, Communication, Culture & Consumption, Design Principles and Practice, Art & Visual production, Envision Future) seeks to solve the tendency towards isolated, less balanced research projects and has opened the possibility: (1) to cover all areas of interest in a more fluid way; (2) be better visible for industry and other external organizations; (3) to a better alignment with the -four- cornerstones of UNIDCOM/IADE.

The PhD supervision process could be further optimized, without jeopardizing what has been achieved already. More systematic attention to design-based entrepreneurship could be added to the curriculum, thus better preparing the 'promovendi' (young researchers with a completed PhD) for an attractive position in society.

The appropriateness of the objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed as part of the visit was found to be very good. The group has clear thematic clusters of activity which underpin their organisation and

their established PhD programmes. Their approach to the development of a national centre of design by actively integrating researchers from other universities and via cooperation with industry, including new ventures and own spin offs to be located at the Lisbon's Tech Park (Lispolis), and in cooperation with leading design institutes from abroad (Finland, Italy, Netherlands etc.) is noteworthy.

Their vision in this regard, towards becoming "an international reference for Design Research" could be considered as an ambitious but feasible point of departure. The high quality of the international research advisory board adds to this.

In order to achieve its high ambitions, it is noteworthy that the Unit has put a focussed and realistic development plan in place to increase research activities and grant submission, increase funding, and raise reputation and internationalization. Building upon an extensive network of institutes in approximately 25 countries and with a focus on both Portuguese speaking countries as well as the Anglo-Saxon world, a fruitful breeding ground is considered to be there to further achieve the mission of the UNIDCOM/IADE.

The Unit is encouraged to continue on its desired way to a leading international position in the design research field. Most of the ingredients are already in place, but an extra attempt should be made to further streamline and professionalize the PhD process, thereby increasing the PhD output, and involving the School fully – including BSc and MSc level – in design research practice and thinking.

The group should consider further how it proposes to develop its internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in design. In this regard, the group is encouraged to promote itself and its scientific results with even more vigour and to avoid a too modest marketing attitude. The group is encouraged to operationalize its international development plan to the full extent, including a stronger role for and engagement of – today's but also future – IADE's PhD and MSc students, as well as alumni, who are already active in many parts of the world.

R&D Unit: Vidro e Cerâmica para as Artes (VICARTE)

Coordinator: Márcia Gomes Vilarigues **Integrated PhD Researchers:** 20

Overall Quality Grade: EXCELLENT **Evaluation Criteria Ratings**

(A) Quality, merit, relevance and internationalization of the

R&D activities of the Integrated Researchers in the R&D Unit Application: 5
(B) Merit of the team of Integrated Researchers: 5
(C) Appropriateness of objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organization: 5

Base Funding for (2020-2023): 331 K€ Recommended Programmatic Support

PhD Fellowships: 5

Programmatic Funding: 352 K€, including for 1 (Junior) New PhD Researcher Contract.

Justification, Comments and Recommendations

The visit by the Panel confirmed that VICARTE is a flagship R&D Unit dedicated to the research, preservation and dissemination of knowledge related to artistic and design production using glass and ceramics. VICARTE offers unique opportunities for collaboration between disciplines in a manner that satisfies rigorous scientific criteria while preserving artistic freedom. The Unit uses mixed methods approaches combining precision archaeometry with qualitative and studio-oriented experimental artistic methodologies. These can be seen in their philosophy which sees the science laboratory and the artist's studio as sites of performance. Here artistic gaze and scientific observation are used as lenses allowing for simultaneous, yet distinct inquiries to the objects under study. Among the final objectives demonstrated is the unravelling of narratives locked in the artefacts.

Industrial research: Current ongoing work on luminescent materials for glass with the objective of substituting rare earth materials for non-toxic, more accessible ones. This is extremely important research with potential for ground breaking results in areas involving sustainability as well as future economic development. Renowned glass artists as well as the artists of VICARTE, have exploited the potential of these materials in works presented in national and international exhibitions.

Heritage: The SOS Azulejos! project dealing with producing environmentally friendly methods and materials for cleaning Portuguese tiles as well as stained glass heritage objects. Among the key topics of this important research is the development of new methods for preservation and recuperation and dissemination of heritage.

Academic: Thirteen PhD theses between the years of 2013–2018.

Their approach to internationalization has several components, including scientific programme as well as a component involving social responsibility and closely tied to the Portuguese colonial and post-colonial identity. Regarding their scientific efforts, they are a European signpost and this can be seen in their participation as full members in the ERC network project, Artechne. Additionally, they participate in European COST actions. One example of the social component in their work is the Art, Craft and Communities project featuring knowledge exchange with Cape Verde immigrants in Lisbon as well as transcontinental exchanges that enable knowledge acquisition at the site of origins. Knowledge about the different crafts gained is further retained and worked with in the Oral Histories for preservation of Craft Knowledge project.

This is close to a world class team with younger researchers who are passionate about their topics and work. The team has a strong national component while at the same time enjoying the active cooperation with international experts. Their activities are well-balanced, bridging together scientific pursuits with artistic practice. For example, during the site visit the Panel had the opportunity to speak with an internationally recognized artist from Spain who undertakes periodic artist residencies at VICARTE. Art students at the Centre benefit from working with a seasoned professional who tutors and advises them in the preparation of their exhibitions.

The objectives, strategy, plan of activities and organisation of the group observed are Excellent and right on target. The group has a clear trajectory and there is a good organizational structure and rapport between the more junior researchers and the senior experts. Their approach in seeking to develop a national Centre of Excellence is right on track: in their collaborations with the artists the scientists have found fertile ground. With this in mind, they plan to increase the participation of artists in their programmes. They have already applied and scored highly in a Marie Curie application to further develop their PhD base. Though not granted this time, they are now re-grouping and planning a re-submission through the Innovative Training Network (ITN) programme.

VICARTE comprises a convergence of researchers and creative practitioners with representatives from Arts and Science. It is an Excellent R&D Unit with a unique identity and novel approaches to transdisciplinary research.

The group should reflect how it proposes to develop further internationalisation activities in the context of establishing itself as an international reference in one of more of its thematic areas. In this regard, the group is encouraged to identify international "benchmark" peers with a view to cultivating targeted collaborative activities to strengthen their profile and impact in the international arena.

Their mixed research methodologies should continue to strive for inclusion of artistic approaches. It could be consolidated into a comprehensive VICARTE toolkit, thus maximising the impact of their research internationally.